ARTICLE

Dror E. Warschawski · Pierre Fellmann Philippe F. Devaux

High-resolution ³¹P-¹H two-dimensional Nuclear Magnetic Resonance spectra of unsonicated lipid mixtures spinning at the magic-angle

Received: 18 April 1996 / Accepted: 26 July 1996

Abstract For multilamellar suspensions of phospholipids, the ¹H and ³¹P Nuclear Magnetic Resonance (NMR) spectra obtained with magic-angle spinning (MAS) exhibit resolution comparable to that of sonicated vesicles. However, specific lipid head groups cannot be recognized in a lipid mixture using one-dimensional NMR spectroscopy. We show here that the combination of MAS and two-dimensional Heteronuclear Overhauser Effect SpectroscopY (HOESY) reveals magnetic interactions between the phosphate and its neighbouring protons and thus allows the distinction in situ of several lipids in a mixture. The ³¹P-¹H HOESY spectra of suspensions of phosphatidylcholine and phosphatidylglycerol or phosphatidylcholine, phosphatidylethanolamine and sphingomyelin are shown as examples. In the course of these experiments, intramolecular spin-diffusion as well as intermolecular interactions between lipids and water were observed. The technique should enable the investigation of lipid-lipid and lipid-protein interactions, lipid hydration as well as lipid asymmetry in membranes without the use of isotopically labeled lipids.

Key words Liposome · Solid-State NMR · Magic-Angle Spinning · Lipid-water interaction · Spin-diffusion

Abbreviations NMR Nuclear Magnetic Resonance · MAS Magic-angle spinning · NOE Nuclear overhauser effect · NOESY NOE SpectroscopY · HOESY Heteronuclear Overhauser Effect SpectroscopY · SUV Sonicated unila-

D. E. Warschwaski¹ · P. Fellmann Laboratoire de Biophysique Cellulaire, Université Denis Diderot, 2, place Jussieu, F-75251 Paris Cédex 05, France

P. F. Devaux (⊠) Institut de Biologie Physico-Chimique, 13, rue Pierre et Marie Curie, F-75005 Paris, France (Fax (33)-1-40 51 83 17; e-mail devaux@ibpc.fr)

Present address:

¹ Francis Bitter Magnet Laboratory,

Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 170 Albany street, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA

mellar vesicles · MLV Multilamellar vesicles · PC Phosphatidylcholine · PG Phosphatidylglycerol · PS Phosphatidylserine · PE Phosphatidylethanolamine · SM Sphingomyelin · FID Free induction decay · INEPT Insensitive nuclei enhanced by polarization transfer

Introduction

Biological membranes always contain a unique lipid composition with different head groups and a wide variety of acyl chains. The various components are not distributed at random: each leaflet of a biological membrane has its own composition (Devaux 1991) and most proteins interact with specific lipids (Marsh 1995). Because of lipid segregation in the membrane, introducing an external probe to the membrane can provide information only on the region explored by this probe. Thus, it is of interest to use unlabeled lipids and to be able to differentiate *in situ* the various lipid components in order to determine their location and physical properties in a mixture.

High resolution Nuclear Magnetic Resonance (NMR) is a way to approach this problem since ¹H, ¹³C or ³¹P spectra with narrow lines can be obtained with naturally occuring lipids if vesicles are sonicated. Sonicated Unilamellar Vesicles (SUVs) have an average diameter of the order of 40 nm and thus undergo rapid tumbling. Many NMR studies have been carried out with SUVs (Finer et al. 1971; Sheetz and Chan 1972; Bystrov et al. 1972; Neumann et al. 1985; Swairjo et al. 1994). However, the high curvature of SUVs creates a physical stress and introduces a difference between inner and outer leaflets that is not encountered in biological membranes. MultiLamellar Vesicles (MLVs), obtained simply by the suspension of lipids in water, have an average diameter of the order of 1 µm and their lipids are more likely to adopt a structure close to that of real biological membranes. The lipid concentration can be much greater in MLVs than in SUVs because the inner volume of the MLVs is reduced, although a minimum amount of water, of the order of 50% by weight, is required to preserve the L_{α} liquid crystalline phase (Luzzati and Husson 1962). The proton and phosphorus spectra of MLVs are normally very broad, either because the dipolar interaction between protons or the chemical shift anisotropy of the phosphorus is not averaged out by the slow tumbling of the vesicles. However, as was shown first by Oldfield and collaborators, high resolution ¹H and ¹³C spectra of lipids in MLVs (Oldfield et al. 1987) or in biological membranes (Husted et al. 1993) can be obtained if the samples are ra-

pidely rotated at the magic-angle. While natural abundance ¹³C spectra require very long accumulation, ¹H is a very sensitive nucleus, has a 100% natural abundance and a short T_1 : it is *a priori* the perfect nucleus to study biological samples, even in water (Warschawski and Devaux 1995). However, proton linewidths in lipid samples are of the order of 0.1 ppm, even with sonication or Magic-Angle Spinning (MAS), and this resolution is hardly enough to allow separation of two lipids (Neumann et al. 1985). This is a consequence of the fact that the differences in chemical structure of common lipid head groups are small. In terms of studying phospholipid mixtures, the relatively poor resolution of ¹H NMR in the headgroup region can be improved if it is used in conjunction with a nucleus such as ${}^{13}C$ (Gross et al. 1995) or ${}^{31}P$. Most phospholipids contain only one ³¹P nucleus but it also has a 100% natural abundance, it is relatively sensitive, absent in most common solvents, located in a very strategic place on the molecule and its isotropic chemical shift is generally characteristic of the headgroup (Michaelson et al. 1973; Tacnet et al. 1991; Merchant and Glonek 1992; Pinheiro and Watts 1994). While ¹H or ³¹P 1D-NMR can resolve some pairs of lipids in a mixture, significant overlap still occurs for each nucleus.

The usefulness of heteronuclear ³¹P{¹H} 1D-NOE transfer in lipids has already been shown by Yeagle et al. in 1975 and by others, using sonicated vesicles of mixed lipids (Yeagle et al. 1975; Yeagle et al. 1976, Schmidt et al. 1977; Yeagle et al. 1977). The 2D Heteronuclear nuclear Overhauser Effect SpectroscopY (HOESY) pulse sequence has proven to be effective in showing intermolecular interactions between various molecules and water (Rinaldi 1983; Yu and Levy 1983 a and b; Seba and Ancian 1990; Canet et al. 1992; Gerothanassis et al. 1992; Santos et al. 1994; Ganapathy et al. 1995). In this paper, we show that the combination of ³¹P-¹H HOESY and MAS enables the resolution of complicated mixtures with fewer ambiguities than 1D NMR alone and allows the unambiguous determination of which protons are connected to a particular phosphate in aqueous dispersions of MLVs that contain several different phospholipids.

Materials and Methods

Samples were made by mixing 40 to 70 mg of lyophilised lipids (Sigma, St Quentin Fallavier, France). Phosphatidylcholine (PC), Phosphatidylglycerol (PG), Phosphatidyl Ethanolamine (PE) and Sphingomyelin (SM) were from egg-yolk. Phosphatidylserine was from bovine brain. For the mixed lipid dispersions, the lipids were codissolved in chloroform/methanol (5:1). The solvent was removed by rotoevaporation under argon followed by high-vacuum lyophilisation overnight. The lipid mixtures were dispersed in the same amount of H_2O or D_2O , stirred under argon and freeze-thawed several times to facilitate the creation of a homogeneous lipid dispersion.

All experiments were performed on a BRUKER AMX400-WB NMR spectrometer (¹H resonance at 400 MHz, ³¹P resonance at 162 MHz), using a BRUKER MAS probe with an external lock. The samples were contained in 4 mm ZrO₂ rotors, the spinning speed was stabilized at 8000 Hz and the temperature was controlled at 30 °C. ¹H and ³¹P (90°) pulse lengths were typically 7 μ s and 3.5 μ s respectively.

The HOESY sequence is similar to the NOESY sequence except the third (90°) pulse, before aquisition, is applied to the X nucleus rather than to the proton. A (180°) pulse on the X channel is inserted in the middle of the evolution period to eliminate J-coupling effects. The ideal mixing time is of the order of the T_1 of the interacting protons, in this case around 500 ms. ¹H decoupling was not applied during detection of the ³¹P magnetization because it was found to be unnecessary when spinning the sample at 8000 Hz. The relaxation delay was 1 or 2 s, each FID was the average of 32 to 1280 scans and 64 to 256 FID were acquired, for a total time of 2 to 48 h. Prior to 2D Fourier transformation, the data were zero-filled, automatically baseline corrected and multiplied with a sine-bell window function shifted by 45° along the ¹H axis and with an exponential broadening of 7 Hz in the ³¹P dimension.

Results

1. Phosphatidylcholine

³¹P-¹H MAS-HOESY experiments performed on a sample of PC in D₂O with a mixing time of 100 ms showed only one cross-peak which corresponds to the expected correlation between the phosphate and its nearest headgroup neighbour, the α -CH₂. The crosspeak intensity was maximal at this mixing time and no other crosspeaks appeared at other mixing times (data not shown). A comparison between the 1D-¹H projection of this 2D spectrum and a ¹H spectrum obtained with a single (90°)-observation pulse on a similar sample is shown in Fig. 1.

If we replace D_2O with H_2O and use the same mixing time, an additional cross-peak is observed between the phosphate and the water protons (data not shown). However, in this case, if we increase the mixing time, other peaks appear. Their absolute intensity is small but observable with a concentrated sample, even at a mixing time of 600 ms. The comparison between the $1D^{-1}H$ projection of this 2D spectrum and the ¹H spectrum obtained with a single (90°) observation pulse facilitates the identification (Fig. 1 b). It is noteworthy that the relative intensities of



Fig. 1 Comparison between **a** the ¹H projection of a ³¹P-¹H HOE-SY spectrum of 60 mg PC in 50% D₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 100 ms mixing time and 1 s recycle time. 128 files, 32 scans per file. Total recording time: 1 h 30, **b** the ¹H projection of a ³¹P-¹H HOE-SY spectrum of 70 mg PC in 50% H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 600 ms mixing time and 2 s recycle time. 64 files, 256 scans per file. Total recording time: 12 h, and **c** 400 MHz ¹H MAS spectrum of 70 mg PC in 50% H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 4 kHz. 3 s recycle time, 8 scans and 3 Hz line-broadening

the cross-peaks are not directly related to the number of protons involved. The most intense peak is the water peak, followed by the two methylenes closest to the phosphate, the α -CH₂ of the headgroup and the 3-CH₂ of the glyce-rol. Then, in decreasing order, the other headgroup protons γ -(CH₃)₃ and β -CH₂ and finally, a small peak corresponding to the aliphatic methylenes.

2. Phosphatidylcholine-Phosphatidylglycerol

We have also studied membranes made of PC and PG. The sample contained only 30 mg of each lipid and a longer experiment time was necessary to achieve the same signalto-noise ratio. As in the case of PC alone, when the sample is made in D₂O there is only one cross-peak for PC or PG. However, in H₂O, the PC phosphate in the PC-PG mixture has one¹H cross-peak with the closest headgroup neighbour the α -CH₂ and, possible, one with its closest glycerol neighbour, the 3-CH₂. The PG phosphate has only one cross-peak because the ¹H chemical shifts of its α -CH₂ and 3-CH₂ are not resolved. Figure 2 shows the ³¹P-¹H MAS-HOESY spectrum in H₂O with a mixing time of 50 ms where spin-diffusion is minimum.

When the same conditions are used with a 200 ms mixing time, the intensity of the fast relaxing peaks is decreased but new cross-peaks appear between each phosphate and the water protons. This can be seen in the different ¹H projections of the corresponding ³¹P-¹H MAS-HOESY spectra (Figs. 3 and 4).



Fig. 2 $2D^{31}P^{-1}H$ HOESY spectrum of 60 mg PC/PG (50:50) in 50% H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 50 ms mixing time and 1 s recycle time. 128 files of 2 K points, 128 scans per file. Total recording time: 5 h



Fig. 3 Comparison between **a** the ¹H projection of Fig. 2, mixing time is 50 ms, corresponding to the region around the PC ³¹P chemical shifts (-0.3 ppm to 0.3 ppm), **b** same as **a** except mixing time is 200 ms and **c** 400 MHz ¹H MAS spectrum of the same sample at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 3 s recycle time, 8 scans and 3 Hz linebroadening

3. Phosphatidylcholine, Phosphatidylethanolamine, Sphingomyelin

It would be interesting to differentiate the four main glycerophospholipids present in the plasma membrane of human erythrocytes. Unfortunately, neither ¹H-NMR nor ³¹P-NMR is able to clearly differentiate PC from PS (data not shown). We have therefore studied mixtures of three phospholipids: PC, SM and PE.



Fig. 4 Comparison between **a** the ¹H projection of Fig. 2, mixing time is 50 ms, corresponding to the region around the PG ³¹P chemical shifts (0.8 ppm to 1.4 ppm), **b** same as **a** except mixing time is 200 ms and **c** 400 MHz ¹H MAS spectrum of the same sample at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 3 s recycle time, 8 scans and 3 Hz linebroadening



Fig. 5 400 MHz 1 H MAS spectrum of PC (20 mg)/PE (20 mg)/SM (20 mg) in 60 mg D₂O and 25 mg H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 3 s recycle time, 8 scans and 3 Hz line-broadening

PC and SM differ only by a few atoms on their backbone, yet their biological and physico-chemical behaviours are very different, for example in their interaction with cholesterol (Demel et al. 1977; Smaby et al. 1994). Their ¹H NMR spectra are very similar but their ³¹P NMR chemical shifts are different. Similarly, the phosphates of PC and PE have different ³¹P chemical shifts and their α -CH₂ also have different ¹H chemical shifts.

We have obtained ${}^{31}P{}^{-1}H$ MAS-HOESY spectra of PC/SM and PC/PE (50:50) in D₂O, with 100 ms mixing



Fig. 6 162 MHz 31 P MAS spectrum of PC (20 mg)/PE (20 mg)/SM (20 mg) in 60 mg D₂O and 25 mg H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 3 s recycle time, 8 scans and 3 Hz line-broadening



Fig. 7 $2D^{31}P^{-1}H$ HOESY spectrum of PC (20 mg)/PE (20 mg)/SM (20 mg) in 60 mg D₂O and 25 mg H₂O, at 30 °C, spinning at 8 kHz. 50 ms mixing time and 1 s recycle time. 128 files of 2 k points, 1280 scans per file. Total recording time: 48 h

time (data not shown). Only the α -CH₂ cross-peaks are visible. No direct cross-peak is observable between the phosphate and the choline protons γ -(CH₃)₃ or the NH exchangeable protons of SM. The latter results were obtained with large multilamellar vesicles, a direct comparison with experiments carried out with sonicated lipid vesicles of the same chemical composition may not be fully justified, nevertheless, one may note that they appear to contradict Yeagle's results.

When PC, PE and SM are mixed in equal weights, the ¹H 1D-NMR is unable to resolve PC from SM (Fig. 5) and ³¹P 1D-NMR is unable to resolve SM from PE (Fig. 6). Only ³¹P-¹H HOESY can do so, as illustrated by the spectrum in Fig. 7. The mixing time was 50 ms and the recording time 48 h owing to the very low concentration of each lipid in the sample. Only the three expected cross peaks between each phosphate and the α -CH₂ of the same lipid are visible.

Discussion

MAS NMR was first applied to lipids in 1972 by Chapman and collaborators (Chapman et al. 1972) but became more useful as spinning speeds and magnetic field strengths increased (Haberkorn et al. 1978; Oldfield et al. 1987; Pinheiro and Watts 1994). At 9.4 T, spinning at 8 kHz is enough to average out the ³¹P chemical shift anisotropy as well as the residual heteronuclear (³¹P-¹H) and homonuclear (¹H-¹H) dipolar couplings. At this spinning speed, one can obtain high resolution ¹H spectra of lipids in the liquid-crystalline phase and decoupling the protons does not improve the ³¹P linewidth.

Magnetization can be transferred from protons to phosphorus through the scalar or the dipolar couplings of these nuclei. Unfortunately, the scalar J-coupling of the phosphate to the nearest bound proton is only about 7 Hz, which is smaller than both the ¹H and the ³¹P averaged linewidth. If one tries to use INEPT-like sequences, a 70 ms delay would be necessary to observe a transfer and by that time the magnetization would have almost completely disappeared, because of T₂ relaxation. Particular sequences have been designed to detect such small couplings (Gerothanassis et al. 1992; Chary et al. 1993; Roumestand et al. 1993; Santos et al. 1994) but they have not yet been applied to lipid systems.

The technique more frequently used in solid-state NMR, is to transfer magnetization using the ³¹P-¹H dipolar coupling between the phosphate and the nearest protons. This coupling is between two neighbouring nuclei and depends on the distance which could potentially provide additional structural information. Unfortunately, in the case of these partially mobile systems, the coherent dipolar couplings are averaged out when spinning at 8 kHz and the simple cross-polarization from protons to phosphorus is very inefficient. However, one can still observe the incoherent heteronuclear NOE transfer between the two nuclei. The main drawback of this technique is the timescale of the heteronuclear NOE transfer which is slow and competes with other relaxation processes. Theoretically, in the extreme narrowing condition limit ($\tau_c \ll \omega_0$), the ³¹P signal should be enhanced by a factor of $1+\gamma^{1}H/(2\gamma^{3}P)=2.25$. This enhancement is never obtained in practice because of relaxation, slow lipid movements (Yeagle et al. 1977) and the relatively large ³¹P-¹H distances. The ³¹P signal, transferred from the fast relaxing protons, can be increased by reducing the repetition time and signal averaging more. However, this was not the purpose of the present experiments which were designed to distinguish various lipids in a mixture via the proton interactions with the phosphate.

Interesting structural and dynamic information were inferred by Yeagle and others from 1D-NMR heteronuclear ³¹P{¹H} NOE transfer experiments with sonicated vesicles of mixed lipids (Yeagle et al. 1975; Yeagle et al. 1976; Schmidt et al. 1977; Yeagle et al. 1977). Among other observations, magnetization transfer between the γ -(CH₃)₃ protons of PC and the PE phosphate has been attributed to intermolecular interactions between neighbouring lipids. A greater ³¹P{¹H} NOE enhancement observed for SM in H₂O vs. D₂O has also been attributed to an interaction between the phosphate and the ceramide backbone of the lipid. In 1983, Burns et al. noticed that the selectivity of the ¹H pulse used in these experiments was not sufficient to warrent such conclusions and that the results depended slightly upon sample preparation. They ruled out intermolecular interactions and argued that some of the magnetization transfers could be explained by spin-diffusion. The greater ³¹P{¹H} NOE enhancement in H₂O vs. D₂O was also observed in PC and was attributed to the interaction of phosphates with hydration water rather than the lipid backbone. More recently, different groups have tried different methods to solve the controversy (Akutsu 1986; Milburn and Jeffrey 1990; Tauskela and Thompson 1992), but none of these methods have implemented 2D-NMR or magic-angle spinning.

From our experiments with PC, we can see that the only protons in direct magnetic contact with the phosphates of lipids are the protons of water and of the two closest methylenes, the headgroup α -CH₂ and the glycerol 3-CH₂. Because of the slow movement experienced by the glycerol backbone, the α -CH₂ cross-peak is always more intense than the glycerol 3-CH₂ cross-peak which is not visible, when the signal/noise ratio is poor (Davis et al. 1995). It is likely that the fast motion experienced by the headgroup, fulfilling the "extreme narrowing" conditions, makes the α -CH₂ peak narrower and improves the NOE transfer, as pointed out by Yeagle.

For the same mixing time, the cross-peaks are also more intense when the sample is dispersed in H₂O rather than in D_2O . The appearance of the other cross-peaks in H_2O only at long mixing times suggests that an indirect process, which we term here spin-diffusion, is the cause of the magnetization transfer (Burns et al. 1983). In this article, we use the term "spin-diffusion" in the sense of Ellena and colaborators (Ellena et al. 1985) to describe "indirect cross relaxation". Such a phenomenon, with lipid protons, was estimated by these authors to take place at a rate of 30 ms/CH_2 . It should not be confused with the coherent spectral spin-diffusion effect observed in solids. This so called spin-diffusion seems to be mostly confined to the headgroup as only very small amounts of magnetization are seen to be transferred to the aliphatic methylenes. Water protons relax much more slowly than lipid protons (2s vs. 500 ms) and could offer a relaxation pathway to the lipids' phosphorus. Of the two possible pathways for the magnetization to go from the phosphate to the methylenes (one is direct and the second is through H_2O), the one implying H_2O seems to be more efficient. This could be due to the fast movements of water, fulfilling the "extreme narrowing conditions", and to its closest contact with the lipid headgroup methylenes.

Conclusions

Studies performed on model membranes containing only one type of lipid or biomembranes probed with a single labeled species are unable to address the question of the biological significance of lipid heterogeneity. In this article we have shown that combining solid-state NMR methods (magic-angle spinning) and liquid-state NMR (³¹P-¹H HOESY sequence) enables the differentiation and identification of individual phospholipid species in a mixed lipid dispersion that cannot be distinguished in a conventional 1D spectrum. Expanding to a second dimension and combining ¹H and ³¹P NMR has greatly improved the resolution and enabled us to study the individual behavior of specific phospholipids in a membrane, without the need for lipid labeling. A careful study of the build-up of the different cross-peaks with increasing mixing time would also be very informative, as it would allow one to obtain structural information, as shown by Palmas et al. (1993).

³¹P-¹H MAS-HOESY has shown that the only lipid protons in direct contact with the phosphates of lipids are the α -CH₂ and the 3-CH₂, and this result is less ambiguous than the one obtained using the ${}^{31}P{}^{1}H{}$ 1D-NOE method. In H₂O, we observed more cross-peaks, including intermolecular cross-peaks, that have enhanced intensity and more slowly relaxing behaviour, suggesting spin-diffusion. We propose a mechanism involving magnetization transfer between the lipid ³¹P to water ¹H and from water protons to other water or lipid protons. Some of the cross-peaks that appear to be direct could actually, at least partly, come from such an in direct pathway. Water molecules might therefore be seen as "magnetization bridges" between the headgroup and the backbone of the lipids, an hypothesis similar to the water bridges between opposing bilayers proposed by McIntosh and Simon (1986).

It is of interest to extend the studies to other lipid mixtures and systems including cholesterol and proteins in order to better approach biological conditions. Unfortunately, these experiments will be long because of the relatively low sensitivity of the method.

Acknowledgements The authors would like to acknowledge G. Cannarozzi, J. D. Gross and M. Traikia for assistance and helpful discussions. D. E. W. was a recipient of a fellowship from the Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche. This work was supported by grants from the Université Denis Diderot, the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (URA 526 and UPR 9052), the Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale and the Association pour la Recherche contre le Cancer.

References

- Akutsu H (1986) Detection of slow-motional changes in the phosphatidylcholine bilayers by ¹H-³¹P cross-polarization dynamics. J Magn Reson 66: 250–263
- Burns RA Jr, Stark RE, Vidusek DA, Roberts MF (1983) Dependence of phosphatidylcholine phosphorus-31 relaxation times and ³¹P{¹H} nuclear Overhauser effect distribution on aggregate structure. Biochemistry 22: 5084–5090
 Bystrov VF, Shapiro YE, Viktorov AV, Barsukov LI, Bergelson LD
- Bystrov VF, Shapiro YE, Viktorov AV, Barsukov LI, Bergelson LD (1972) ³¹P-NMR signals from inner and outer surfaces of phospholipid membranes. FEBS Lett 25: 337–338
- Canet D, Mahieu N, Tekely P (1992) Heteronuclear Overhauser effect measurements in surfactant systems. 1. The direct estimation of the distance between water and the micellar surface. J Am Chem Soc 114: 6190–6194
- Chapman D, Oldfield E, Doskocilova D, Schneider B (1972) NMR of gel and liquid crystalline phospholipids spinning at the "magic-angle". FEBS Lett 25: 261–264
- Chary KVR, Rastogi VK, Govil G (1993) An efficient 2D NMR technique HELCO for heteronuclear [³¹P-¹H] long-range correlation. J Magn Reson B 102:81–83
- Davis JH, Auger M, Hodges RS (1995) High resolution ¹H Nuclear Magnetic Resonance of a transmembrane peptide. Biophys J 69:1917–1932
- Demel RA, Jansen JWCM, Van Dijck PWM, Van Deenen LLM (1977) The preferential interaction of cholesterol with different classes of phospholipids. Biochim Biophys Acta 465: 1–10
- Devaux PF (1991) Static and dynamic lipid asymmetry in cell membranes. Biochemistry 30: 1163–1173
- Ellena JF, Hutton WC, Cafiso (1985) Elucidation of cross relaxation pathways in phospholipid vesicles utilizing two-dimensional 1H NMR spectroscopy. J Am Chem Soc 107:1530–1537
- Finer EG, Flook AG, Hauser H (1971) The use of NMR spectra of sonicated phospholipid dispersions in studies of interactions with the bilayer. FEBS Lett 18:331-334
- Ganapathy S, Siddarth Ray S, Rajamohanan PR, Mashelkar RA (1995) Hydration in polymer studied through magic-angle spinning nuclear magnetic resonance and heteronuclear ¹³C{¹H} Overhauser enhancement spectroscopy: cross-relaxation and location of water in poly(acrylamide). J Chem Phys 103: 6783-6794
- Gerothanassis IP, Birdsall B, Bauer CJ, Feeney J (1992) ³¹P-NMR assignment and conformational study of NADPH bound to Lactobacillus casei dihydrofolate reductase based on two-dimensional ¹H-³¹P-heteronuclear and ¹H-detected ¹H-³¹P-shift-correlation experiments. Eur J Biochem 204: 173–177
- Gross JD, Costa PR, Dubacq JP, Warschawski DE, Lirsac PN, Devaux PF, Griffin RG (1995) Multidimensional NMR in lipid systems. Coherence transfer through J couplings under MAS. J Magn Reson B 106: 187–190
- Haberkorn RA, Herzfeld J, Griffin RG (1978) High resolution ³¹P and ¹³C nuclear magnetic resonance spectra of unsonicated model membranes. J Am Chem Soc 100: 1296–1298
- Husted C, Montez B, Le C, Moscarello MA, Oldfield E (1993) Carbon-13 "magic-angle" sample-spinning nuclear magnetic resonance studies of human myelin and model membrane systems. Magn Reson Med 29: 168–178
- Luzzati V, Husson F (1962) The structure of the liquid-crystalline phases of lipid-water systems. J Cell Biol 12: 207–219
- Marsh D (1995) Lipid-protein interactions and heterogeneous lipid distribution in membranes. Mol Memb Biol 12:59–64
- McIntosh TJ, Simon SA (1986) Area per molecule and distribution of water in fully hydrated dilaurylphosphatidylethanolamine bilayers. Biochemistry 25:4948–4952
- Michaelson DM, Horwitz AF, Klein MP (1973) Transbilayer asymmetry and surface homogeneity of mixed phospholipids in cosonicated vesicles. Biochemistry 12: 2637–2645
- Merchant TE, Glonek T (1992) ³¹P NMR of tissue phospholipids: competition for Mg²⁺, Ca²⁺, Na⁺ and K⁺ cations. Lipids 27:551–559

- Milburn MP, Jeffrey KR (1990) Dynamics of the phosphate group in phospholipid bilayers. A ³¹P-¹H transient Overhauser effect study. Biophys J 58: 187–194
- Neumann JM, Zachowski A, Tran-Dinh S, Devaux PF (1985) High resolution proton magnetic resonance of sonicated phospholipids. Eur Biophys J 11: 219–223
- Oldfield E, Bowers JL, Forbes J (1987) High-resolution proton and carbon-13 NMR of membranes: why sonicate? Biochemistry 26: 6919-6923
- Palmas P, Tekely P, Mutzenhardt, Canet D (1993) Heteronuclear overhauser effect measurements in surfactant systems. IV. Direct and remote correlations within alkyl chains. J Chem Phys 99: 4775-4785
- Pinheiro TJT, Watts A (1994) Resolution of individual lipids in mixed phospholipid membranes and specific lipid-cytochrome c interactions by magic-angle spinning solid-state phosphorus-31 NMR. Biochemistry 33: 2459–2467
- Rinaldi PL (1983) Heteronuclear 2D-NOE spectroscopy. J Am Chem Soc 105: 5167–5168
- Roumestand C, Boudot D, Canet D (1993) Double-selective {¹H, ³¹P} editing of 1D or 2D spectra through small heteronuclear coupling constants based on spin-echo difference spectroscopy. J Magn Reson A 105: 304–309
- Santos RA, Wind RA, Bronnimann CE (1994) ¹H CRAMPS and ¹H-³¹P HetCor experiments on bone, bone mineral, and model calcium phosphate phases. J Magn Reson B 105: 183–187
- Schmidt CF, Barenholz Y, Thompson TE (1977) A nuclear magnetic resonance study of sphingomyelin in bilayer systems. Biochemistry 16: 2649-2656
- Seba HB, Ancian B (1990) Two-dimensional intermolecular heteronuclear ¹³C, ¹H Overhauser effect as a probe for hydration of the amide group. J Chem Soc Chem Commun 1990:996– 997
- Sheetz MP, Chan SI (1972) Effect of sonication on the structure of lecithin bilayers. Biochemistry 11:4573-4581

- Smaby JM, Brockman HL, Brown RE (1994) Cholesterol's interfacial interactions with sphingomyelins and phosphatidylcholines: hydrocarbon chain structure determines the magnitude of condensation. Biochemistry 33:9135–9142
- Swairjo MA, Roberts MF, Campos M-B, Dedman JR, Seaton BA (1994) Annexin V binding to the outer leaflet of small unilamellar vesicles leads to altered inner-leaflet properties: ³¹P- and ¹H-NMR studies. Biochemistry 33: 10944–10950
- Tacnet F, Ripoche P, Roux M, Neumann J-M (1991) ³¹P-NMR study of pig intestinal brush-border membrane structure: effect of zinc and cadmium ions. Eur Biophys J 19: 317–322
 Tauskela JS, Thompson M (1992) A ³¹P-NMR spin-lattice relaxation
- Tauskela JS, Thompson M (1992) A ³¹P-NMR spin-lattice relaxation and ³¹P{¹H} nuclear Overhauser effect study of sonicated small unilamellar phosphatidylcholine vesicles. Biochim Biophys Acta 1104: 137–146
- Warschawski DE, Devaux PF (1995) Water suppression in ¹H MASS NMR spectra of lipids and biological membranes. J Magn Reson B 106: 76–79
- Yeagle PL, Hutton WC, Huang CH, Martin RB (1975) Headgroup conformation and lipid-cholesterol association in phosphatidylcholine vesicles: A ³¹P{¹H} nuclear Overhauser effect study. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 72:3477–3481
- Yeagle PL, Hutton WC, Huang CH, Martin RB (1976) Structure in the polar head region of phospholipid bilayers: A ³¹P{¹H} nuclear Overhauser effect study. Biochemistry 15: 2121–2124
- Yeagle PL, Hutton WC, Huang CH, Martin RB (1977) Phospholipid head-group conformation; intermolecular interaction and cholesterol effects. Biochemistry 16:4344-4349
- Yu C, Levy GC (1983 a) Solvent and intramolecular proton dipolar relaxation of the three phosphates of ATP: a heteronuclear 2D study. J Am Chem Soc 105: 6994–6996
- Yu C, Levy GC (1983b) Two-dimensional heteronuclear NOE (HOESY) experiments: investigation of dipolar interactions between heteronuclei and nearby protons. J Am Chem Soc 106: 6533-6537